The Mapping of Issues Regarding the Adoption of E-Business Among SMEs in Five Continents

Asia-Pacific Management and Business Application 12 (1) 83-100 ©UB 2023 University of Brawijaya Malang, Indonesia http://apmba.ub.ac.id

Sinta Aryani^{*}

Faculty of Industrial Engineering, Telkom University, Bandung, Indonesia

Abstract

E-business in this VUCA era has been increasingly gaining scholars attention especially in the SMES sector. This systematic literature study with the objective to identify the issues faced by SMEs on five continents when they want to adopt e-business. Data was taken from the collection of literature on journal portals such as Google Scholar, Academia, Scopus, and Elsevier, with keywords SMEs, e-business, information technology, digital transformation, and competitiveness. The collection of the literature is not limited by the country. The more countries that are taken, the more this paper reflects the real problems faced by SMEs when they want to adopt e-business. There are 115 collected pieces of literature representing the five continents that exist. The findings obtained from this paper are that all SMEs on five continents have similar issues when they want to adopt e-business. The findings are classified into Technology, Organization, and Environment (TOE) to facilitate classification and analysis and it is found that Technology in terms of business communication, Organization in terms of human resources, and Environment in terms of ICT infrastructure are the most common issues when SMEs want to adopt e-business. However, each continent has its own characteristics.

Keywords

E-business, SMEs, adoption, issues Received: 27 May 2023; Accepted: 20 June 2023; Published Online: 31 August 2023 DOI: 10.21776/ub.apmba.2023.012.01.6

Introduction

Many Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises (SMEs) have to do extra work to survive in the industry due to high competitiveness among firms. One of the determinants of competitiveness is the performance of their exports. Since 2014, the number of exporting enterprises in the European Union (EU) has decreased by 8%, despite an increase in the number of exporting SMEs. The number of SMEs has risen from 76% in 2014 to 87% in 2017. At the same time, the value of export has increased by 12% for all enterprises and 10% for SMEs (Eurostat, 2022). In 2017, more than 700.000 enterprises in the EU sold products outside of the EU, and 615.000 of them are SMEs. In terms of value, the EU SMEs have exported 476 billion euros, representing 28% of the total value of EU export in that year (Eurostat, 2022). The high number of exports in SMEs has been supported by the high intensity of digitalization in the EU SMEs. Further, (Eurostat, 2022) contends that European SMEs seem to perform better than the OECD SMEs due to the digital intensity. Digital intensity is a set of indicators of how far SMEs use the technology. The indicators include the use of ICT security measures, ERP package, any social media, and customer relationship software – CRM (Leogrande, 2022).

The discussion above shows that digitalization can increase а firm's competitiveness in the industry. The digitalization of the industry is generally called electronic business or e-business. A fast-growing e-business has become a global key element of business development and the SMEs are supposed to have e-business to support their productions and transactions. On the production side, ebusiness allows SMEs to undertake supply chain management electronically, and provides the SMEs an opportunity to have better interactions with their suppliers (Dai, 2014). From the transaction side, it opens up opportunities for SMEs to access new markets. Studies have found that e-business helps SMEs in gaining access to new markets and reaching a wider customer base with low-cost internet initiatives. These activities allow SMEs to reduce the cost of meeting clients face-to-face (Ashurst et al., 2012) and secure a competitive advantage (Cataldo & McQueen, 2014). Further, ebusiness helps SMEs to have an efficient process even though efficiency gains are harder to prove in business settings, especially for SMEs.

E-business has been adopted by SMEs for decades in European countries. Many papers mention e-business and its adoption for SMEs (e.g., Drew, 2003; Piscitello & Sgobbi, 2004; Taylor & Murphy, 2004; Wagner et al., 2003). By then, e-business has spread all over the world and right now, e-business has become an interesting subject among SMEs to be adopted, especially in emerging countries. Most recent studies on the adoption of e-business among SMEs emerge from some countries such as Yemen (e.g., Abdullah et al., 2018); Saudi Arabia (e.g., AlBar & Hoque, 2019); Brunei Darussalam (e.g., Almunawar et al., 2022); China (e.g., Ming, 2016), Jordan (e.g. Hossain et al., 2021), and Bangladesh (e.g., B. B. Hossain et al., 2019). Their studies mostly discuss the factors affecting

the adoption of e-business among SMEs in their countries.

The adoption of e-business among SMEs in the EU is quite mature compared to other countries in the world. In this regard, it becomes interesting to discuss more deeply on how the SMEs in the EU adopt ebusiness that contributes to their success in competing abroad, and allow a significant rise in the proportion of their exports. The success stories of SMEs in the EU can be replicated by other SMEs around the world. Determination of factors influencing the adoption of e-business among SMEs in the EU can thus be passed on to other SMEs.

However, none of the papers synthesizing the factors that affect the adoption of ebusiness around the world. **Studies** discussing those factors have been done been separately. studies have done separately. The success factors for adopting e-business among SMEs in the EU have not yet been discussed comprehensively. At the same time, the biggest hurdle to e-business adoption for SMEs in other countries has never been addressed. By collecting information regarding the adoption of ebusiness all around the world, the factors contributing to the adoption will be revealed. This study aims to identify the issues faced by SMEs in various continents when adopting e-business.

E-business is a business activity that involves the use of communication and information technology. The adoption of ebusiness in business activities starts from the production to the transaction process (Lee, 2021). One of the practices of ebusiness adoption is the use of technology in transaction processing of e-commerce and website transactions. It is undeniable that the use of e-business in firms fastens the process of purchasing products and services. It is due to the widespread and increasing use of the internet throughout the world. Nowadays, consumers are more likely to purchase products or services online, especially since the COVID-19 pandemic. As a result, online transactions

have increased rapidly. During the pandemic, Indonesian digital business grew to IDR337 trillion in 2021. The annual ecommerce sales growth increased to 15.4 percent in 2021 (Kementerian Informasi dan Kominikasi (Kominfo), 2022). The high rate of e-commerce transactions proves that the adoption of e-business can increase business sales.

In this digital era, e-business has become essential for business strategy and economic development. This is because ebusiness is proven to increase revenue (Abdullah et al., 2015a). One of the business strategies that can improve business performance is the use of technology, in this case, with the adoption of e-business. The adoption of e-business allows SMEs to integrate supply chain partners and organizational functions (Abdullah et al., 2015a). Furthermore, the use of e-business will lead organizations to have more effective resource management and faster communication of business processes. The adoption of e-business also provides benefits such as a reduction in transaction costs and an increase in transactions (Rahayu and Day, 2017). With the advantages offered by the adoption of ebusiness, a competition between SMEs is increasing. This is because if SMEs adopt ebusiness, they will increase the value of their business.

A number of previous studies have shown that several SMEs in some countries in the world have adopted e-business in their business processes. According to (Ang and Husain, 2012), the integration of a company's business, products, procedures, and services through the internet is the main focus of implementing e-business. It enables the buying and selling of products and services through a web storefront.

Several studies explaining how e-business is adopted in SMEs in various continents, regions, and countries around the world include the following. On the African continent, the size of a company is the most significant factor in the adoption of e-business. According to Wachira (2014), Erumi-Esin and Heeks (2015), and Kissiwaa et al., (2021), various companies have used technology in their sales, such as websites and email. However, internet bandwidth and access costs, especially through mobile phones, are the main hurdles to adopting e-business.

In America, many firms have adopted ebusiness. Higher education, entrepreneurial intensity, informal networks with customers and suppliers, business partnerships, and product innovations are factors that accelerate the adoption of e-business. However, a slow adaptation and a lack of investment in digital technology become hurdles to e-business adoption (Ifinedo, 2011; Middleton and Middleton, 2016; Sánchez-Torres et al., 2021).

In Asia, especially in developed countries, many firms have adopted e-business. Its adoption in Asian countries still depends on the size of the firms and the products or services they provide. Technical IT skills for workers in Asia are increasing according to Wang and Shi (2009). However, the quality of human resources, employee management, and finance have become hurdles to the adoption of e-business in the continent (Abdullah et al., 2015b; Delawari, 2019; B. B. Hossain et al., 2019; Hussein et al., 2013; Lee, 2021).

Eurasia has adopted e-business with the use of social media, applications, websites, or new platforms for small businesses. Although not all SMEs have used ebusiness in their business processes, but the government is trying to encourage them to use e-business in their business by advertising on social media (Demiroglu, 2021).

In Europe, the government fully supports SMEs owners in adopting e-business by increasing consumers' access to broadband technology and the internet, which results in the increased consumers' willingness and sophistication (Sukumar et al., 2011). Building e-marketing (online branding) is the company's strategy. The risks faced in adopting e-business on the European continent are security issues such as viruses and hacking.

Some SMEs in Australia and Oceania have used e-business in their business practices. They use business webpages, websites, emails, etc. Owners and workers also have knowledge of and interest in technology, despite its slow adoption (Bi et al., 2017; Prananto et al., 2004; Ramsey and McCole, 2005).

The conditions of e-business adoption in each of these continents cannot be generalized. In Asia, the adoption of ebusiness in SMEs tends to be more developed in the East Asian region (Lee, 2021) than in the South Asian region (Gide and Sandu, 2015). Likewise, it is difficult for the African continent which still relies on internet and bandwidth providers, to adopt e-business (Mthembu et al., 2018; Raviro et al., 2014).

This study aims to identify the issues of ebusiness adoption in various continents. To do that, the study initially maps the adoption of e-business in all continents. Then, the study identifies the characteristics of hurdles faced by SMEs. Factors that affluence the adoption of e-business are identified and analysed further.

Research Methods

This is a literature review study that aims to shed light on the best practices of e-business adoption around the world. The study uses semi meta-analysis literature review which involves taking the findings from the chosen literatures and analysing these findings by using statistical descriptive i.e., modes. The modes are used together with coding which applied to the literatures after choosing the databases followed by conducting the search. The databases are the journal portals include Google Scholar, Academia, Scopus, and Elsevier. The articles are searched by using keywords of SMEs, e-business, and adoption. There are hundreds of articles generated. All the generated articles are selected by read through their abstracts by dividing into relevant and irrelevant topics of the articles. The articles with relevant topic are kept, it happens to be more than a hundred articles are kept.

The factors regarding the adoption of ebusiness among SMEs were identified from the papers collected. Factors mentioned or discussed in the papers were considered to be the factors that influence the adoption of e-business among SMEs. This study collects all factors from the papers collected. After that, factors mentioned or discussed in the papers were gathered and classified. Factors mentioned in one paper only represent one tally for each factor, and each factor was counted individually. A factor's accumulated number of mentions represents its degree of importance on the adoption of e-business among SMEs.

For example, in a paper the word 'website' is mentioned and it contributes to the adoption of e-business, so the website is identified as a factor that influences the adoption of e-business among SMEs (Alderete, 2019). A firm displays its products or services on its website. Therefore, the customers and suppliers have information regarding the products that the firm offers. A website itself represents a medium of communication among a firm, its customers, and its suppliers. However, the study did not include the detail of the website itself, such as how far the website is developed. As long as the paper discusses website, it is considered as a contributing factor. In another paper, a mobile app is discussed as an aspect considered in adopting e-business among SMEs (Gide and Sandu, 2015). Therefore, a mobile app is identified as a factor as well. A mobile app can be defined as a platform used by a firm and its customers to communicate their purposes in offering, selling, and buying products or services. Both websites and mobile apps are factors that contribute to

adopting e-business among SMEs (Demiroglu, 2021). However, websites and mobile apps are classified as media of communication electronically for a firm. For that reason, both are classified as business communication.

Papers were grouped geographically and factors were identified. For example, papers mentioning e-business factors in Indonesia would be grouped into the Southeast Asian region and the Asian continent. The factors were identified and analysed to determine the influence of the adoption of e-business among SMEs in that certain region.

Factor classifications were sorted based on the most to the least mentioned in the biggest five of papers. The factor classifications were considered the most influential in adopting e-business among SMEs. Geographically, there were five continents including Africa, Asia, America, Europe, and Australia/Oceania. Further, the categorized based papers were on Technology, Organizational, and Environment (TOE) framework. TOE

framework was used as a guidance in reviewing certain contextual factors that affect the use of e-business (Hadi Putra & Santoso, 2020). Even though it is argued that the TOE itself is not enough in reflecting causal relationships, using TOE is good as the basis of information to categorize the factors on the best practice of the SMEs.

Results and Discussion

The study collected the most recent publications published in 2022, followed by ordering them. There were 115 papers collected. Table 1 shows the distribution of papers by year. The papers were classified on the basis of its regions such as Middle East, Southeast Asia, East Asia, Central Asia, South Asia, West Africa, East Africa, South Africa, Southeast Europe, East Europe, Central Europe, Northern Europe, South Europe, North America, South America, Australia, and Oceania. Table 2 shows the distribution of papers by continents.

No	Voor	Number of			
110	Ital	Papers			
1	2022	4			
2	2021	11			
3	2020	2			
4	2019	10			
5	2018	2			
6	2017	4			
7	2016	6			
8	2015	7			
9	2014	5			
10	2013	6			
11	2012	7			
12	2011	7			
13	2010	6			
14	2009	5			
15	2008	5			
16	2007	6			
17	2006	6			
18	2005	3			
19	2004	6			
20	2003	6			
21	2002	-			
22	2001	1			
Total		115			

Table 1	1.	Distribution	of	papers	from	2022	-	2001

There were 11 papers collected that discussed the adoption of e-business among SMEs in Africa. The countries discussed were Botswana, Egypt, Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, South Africa, Zambia, and Zimbabwe. For the American continent, 13 papers discussed the e-business adoption among SMEs in North American countries including Canada, the United States, and Mexico. For the South American countries, one paper each discussed Argentina, Brazil, Columbia, and Jamaica. The most papers were those discussing the collected adoption of e-business among SMEs in Asian countries including Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Brunei Darussalam, China, Hongkong, India, Indonesia, Iraq, Iran,

Japan, Jordan, Kuwait, Malaysia, Nepal, Oman, Pakistan, Singapore, Saudi Arabia, South Korea, Taiwan, Thailand, Turkey, Uzbekistan, United Arab Emirates, Vietnam, and Yemen. There are 7 papers from Australia (Oceania) that include Australia and New Zealand. There were 33 papers collected from Europe discussed Denmark, England, France, Bulgaria, Finland, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Italy, Luxemburg, Malta, Netherlands Norway, Poland, Portugal, Russia, Serbia, Spain, Sweden United Kingdom, and Wales. Altogether, there were 64 countries discussed in terms of the adoption of ebusiness by SMEs in the world.

Continent	Number of Papers		
Africa	11		
America	14		
Asia	49		
Australia	7		
Europe	33		
Oceania	2		
Total	116		

Table 2	. Distribution	of Papers by	Continents
	• Distribution	ULL apello by	Commentes

The study revealed that for all continents, the most influential factors that hinder the adoption of e-business among SMEs were related to organization, except in Africa where organization and technology had similar shares. It was found from about 50% of the papers collected that organization was the most significant factor in influencing the adoption of e-business among SMEs around the world, followed by technology (27%) and environment (23%). Figure 1 shows the influential factors in adopting e-business.



Figure 1. Influential Factors of E-Business Adoption in the World

In Africa, not only issues related to organization, but also the ones related to technology were dominating factors in the adoption of e-business among SMEs. Their shares were 37.50% and 35.71% respectively, followed by the environment (26.79%). The organization issues in terms of management, human resources, and finance were the biggest factors influencing the adoption of e-business among SMEs. Perceived risk of security, culture, and value of a firm became the biggest challenges in management issues besides the issue of human resources (managers' knowledge of IT). Furthermore, the cost of adopting e-business was quite significant but the fund is limited. The study of (Mthembu et al., 2018) suggests that internet connectivity problems in terms of quality, speed, and cost are still the biggest issue faced by SMEs. Thus, issues in organization and technology became the most influential factors that may hinder African SMEs especially in West Africa in adopting e-business or other related electronic business such as e-commerce. Table 3 shows the category impact of adopting e-business by SMEs in all continents.

Table 3. Impacts Based on TOE						
Categories	Impact (%)	TOE Impact	TOE Category			
AFRICA		-				
Company Strategic	1.79%					
Demographics 3.57%		-				
Finance	8.93%	- 37.50%				
Management	14.29%		Organizational			
Human Resources						
Relationship	0%					
Business Technology	16.07%	25 7104	Tashnalagy			
Business Communication	19.64%	- 55.7170	Technology			
Banking	1.79%					
Government	7.14%					
Industry	Industry 5.36%					
Infrastructure	10.71%	_				
Vendor	1.79%	_				
AMERICA						
Company Strategic	4.42%					
Demographics	15.04%					
Finance	4.42%					
Management	11.50%	- 61.95%	Organizational			
Human Resources	24.78%					
Relationship	1.77%	_				
Business Technology	10.62%	21.240/	Taskaslassy			
Business Communication	10.62%	- 21.24%	Technology			
Banking	0.00%					
Government	4.42%					
Industry	5.31%	16.81%	Environment			
Infrastructure	7.08%	—				
Vendor	0.00%					
ASIA						
Company Strategic	2.67%					
Demographics	8.78%					
Finance	8.02%	47 710/	Organizational			
Management	6.49%	- 47.71%				
Human Resources	20.99%					
Relationship	0.76%					
Business Technology	13.36%	24 420/	T			
Business Communication	11.07%	- 24.43%	Technology			
Banking	1.91%					
Government	Government 8.02%		Environment			
Industry	27.86%					
Infrastructure	_					
Vendor	1.53%					
EUROPE						

Company Strategic	1.31%			
Demographics	12.42%			
Finance	4.58%	51 620/		
Management	5.23%	51.05%	Organizational	
Human Resources	25.49%			
Relationship	2.61%			
Business Technology	17.65%	- 30 07%	Tashnalagu	
Business Communication	12.42%	30.07%	Technology	
Banking	0.00%			
Government	5.88%			
Industry	5.23%	22.22%	Environment	
Infrastructure	11.11%			
Vendor	0.00%			
AUSTRALIA & OCEANIA				
Company Strategic	3.23%			
Demographics	3.23%		Organizational	
Finance	3.23%	51 910/		
Management	12.90%	- 34.04%	Organizational	
Human Resources	29.03%			
Relationship	3.23%			
Business Technology	12.90%	- 22 260/	Technology	
Business Communication	19.35%	32.20%		
Banking	0.00%			
Government 0.00%				
Industry	3.23%	12.90%	Environment	
Infrastructure	6.45%	_		
Vendor	3.23%	_		

Different from Africa, organization became the most influential factor in the American continent, which shared 61.95%. It contained human resources, demographics, and management. Each of them had contributions of 24.78%, 15.04%, and 11.50% respectively. Issues related to human resources covered the issues of education, entrepreneur experiences, and age of the owners or managers. For the demographics category, the issues were related to the characteristic of the firms that include size, type of industry, and market scope. in terms of management, the issues were culture, readiness, and leadership. Based on TOE, the share of organization 61.95% whereas the share of was technology was 21.24%. Meanwhile, the share of environment was 16.81%.

Similar to factors in the American continent, in Asia, the most significant factor was organization with human resources as the biggest issue (20.99%), followed by demographics and finances at 8.78% and 8.02% respectively. Education, managers, and skills were the top three factors that became the significant issues of human resources. In terms of demographics and finances, the SMEs in Asia considered finances including funds and expenses to be important aspects to adopt e-business. In general, the issues related to organization, environment, and technology gave contribution as much as 47.71%, 27.86%, and 24.43% respectively.

Technology and environment have less influence compared to organization if SMEs want to adopt e-business in Europe. They provide shares of 28.10%, 20.26%, and 51.63% respectively. Organization becomes the most influential factor in adopting e-business with human resources, demographics, and management contributing the most for this category. Each of them contributes as much as 25.49%, 12.42%, and 4.58% respectively. From the explanation above, it can be concluded that organization is the common issues faced by the SMEs in adopting ebusiness. The SMEs in all continents, except Africa, consider organization to be the most important aspect in adopting ebusiness. In the four continents, the organization shares were around 50%. However, in Africa, both organization and technology play crucial roles in the adoption of e-business among SMEs (Table 3).



Figure 2. The Spread of Organization Issues in All Continents

Figure 2 shows the spread of organization issues in all continents. Under human resources, education is the most significant issue in the four continents. The level of education, especially for managers of the firms, has contributed to how e-business is adopted among SMEs. Bordonaba-Juste et al., 2012; Mazzarol, 2015; Nugroho et al., 2017; Siddoo et al., 2019 suggest that the level of education matters for SMEs if they want to adopt e-business. The higher the level of education is the higher probability adopt the **SMEs** will e-business. Furthermore, the higher the education, the comprehensive more e-business is developed in the firms and the firms that adopt e-business comprehensively will develop e-business in all aspects of the business. However, not many SMEs adopt e-business comprehensively. Most of them only adopt marketing and sales electronically or through e-commerce (Zare, 2015). Further (Wynn et al., 2013) mention that the adoption of e-business is staging, and e-commerce is usually adopted first before the SMEs adopt internal integration and external integration electronically comprehensive (a ebusiness). The level of education influences how e-business is applied and developed among SMEs.



Figure 3. The Spread of Technology Issues in All Continents

Technology issues are divided into business technology and business communication. Business technology is technology related adopting e-business. It contains to technology integration, IT resources. security, suitable technology, technology adoption, and technology readiness. Meanwhile, business communication is defined as the platform used by SMEs to communicate with external parties, including customers, suppliers, vendors, etc. With regard to this definition and how SMEs perform communication, business

communication is constructed by mobile applications, big data, e-commerce, e-mail, e-business, social media, voice/SMS, and websites. This study found that technology issues were split into two among the continents. America, Asia, and Europe tended to have more issues in business technology whereas Africa and Australia/Oceania tended to have more issues in business communication. Figure 3. shows how technology issues are spread among the continents.



Figure 4. The Spread of Environment Issues in All Continents

Regarding environmental issues, infrastructure played the most important role in SMEs adopting e-business, followed by the role of government and industry. Figure 4 shows the environmental issues in all continents. Most infrastructure issues were related to ICT infrastructure and broadband connectivity. Related to the government role, their supports were including policies and institutions. especially related to the financial burden of internet access. Furthermore, some support was needed to ease the SMEs adjustment to the changing environment. The industry had an important role in adopting ebusiness. especially in terms of competitors. The force of competitors influences SMEs to adopt e-business.

Organization

Human resources were the most important issue found in all continents, followed by demographics and management. Finance was not a significant issue, except for Asia SMEs. Human resources were related to knowledge, education, and skill of the management and owners of the SMEs. The higher the level of human resources is, the higher the possibility of the SMEs adopting e-business will be (Drew, 2003).

Knowledge of managers or owners in terms of perceived benefit and computer literacy in adopting e-business (Mpofu et al., 2009), along with their leadership style, benefits the firms to have better business efficiency, competitiveness, planning, and management. Meanwhile, knowledge of employees (Wang and Shi. 2009) influences the readiness of firms in adopting e-business. However. an additional factor of owners' leadership style has also benefited firms to adopt ebusiness faster (Siddoo et al., 2019).

The level education of the CEO (Parida et al., 2009), manager (Grandon & Pearson, 2004), and employee (Abu Abid & Rahim, 2012) benefits the firms in adopting ebusiness better. CEOs with higher education can motivate their employees, so they can adjust smoothly when adopting ebusiness (Levenburg et al., 2006).

Skills, especially in technical IT including programming, system analysis, and design, benefit firms in adopting e-business better. SMEs, in general, have fewer skilled employees (Albar and Hoque, 2019). This fact should encourage the managers or owners to support their employees to gain more skills and competencies so they can adapt themselves to a new system. Demographic issues include the issues of the size of firms, market orientation, and type of industry.

Technology

Based on the papers collected, technology can be divided into business technology and business communication. Both can be adopted at different levels depending on business their readiness. For communication, the level of adoption refers to the paper of Abdullah et al., (2018) that divides the adoption level into eight stages including no internet access, email, social media, websites, e-commerce, mobile apps, cloud services, e-business, and transformed organization. In Africa, most SMEs dealt with lower-level issues of business communication adoption such as email and websites. Only some of the SMEs in Africa have already dealt with e-commerce and mobile apps for their business. None of the papers mention the adoption of e-business there. This situation leads to the conclusion the SMEs have not been familiar with ebusiness. For this reason, the adoption of business technology is relatively low in Africa compared to other continents (Figure 3.). Continents with higher level adoption of business communication in their SMEs tend to have issues in business technology, for instance, SMEs in Asia and Europe. In Asia, technology readiness and integration followed by security issues have been major issues faced by the SMEs.

Technology readiness and integration are related to the definition of e-business itself, which is defined as conducting transactions along the value chain; it includes purchasing from upstream suppliers, and products selling and services to downstream customers by using the internet platform together with the existing technology information and (IT)infrastructure (Oliveira and Martins, 2010). Therefore, technology readiness and technology integration become the most important issues based on the definition above. The engagement of SMEs with ebusiness depends on the readiness of technology in terms of humans and tools, whether or not the technology is ready to be their business. applied in However,

technology readiness relies on the availability of IT infrastructure. The data gathered from the papers collected show that infrastructure plays important role in ebusiness adoption among SMEs, especially in Asia and Europe (Figure 3). Besides technology readiness infrastructure. correlates with technical knowledge and skill of the management and IT investment performed by the management (Hussein et al., 2013). Furthermore, the numbers and varieties of IT installations such as computers, servers, LAN, Wi-Fi are also related to the stage of adoption of ebusiness (Zhu et al., 2006). In SMEs with technology readiness. higher their management will have higher technical knowledge and skill regarding the adoption of technology in their business, supported by the availability of IT installation in their firms. Meanwhile, technology integration discusses how the internet system has fully functioned in the business system. The firms with lower internet system adoption may function with limited internet in their business. Their systems are only limited to the use of email, social media, and websites. The higher-level adoption of the internet system allows the firm to perform a higher level of e-business such as ecommerce, mobile apps, and cloud service. Meanwhile, the highest adoption is the organization transformation.

The issue of security is dominant in Asian SMEs. They do not only deal with payment systems in online trading but also the customers' private data theft. More convenient payment methods may help firms to deal with the adoption of online payment. Financial inclusion becomes important for SMEs to know about. The issue of customer data protection has risen in the Asian region, especially those with regard to the private data theft.

Environment

SMEs in all continents consider infrastructure as a significant issue, especially telecommunication infrastructure. This issue causes the limited use of online business and internet banking that support payment methods. Besides telecommunication infrastructure. the government's role is another issue faced by SMEs. The government's role includes the regulatory support and the availability of infrastructure that will assist SMEs in engaging with e-business. This intervention can lower the cost of internet access with higher internet bandwidth (Mwila and Ngoyi, 2019). Government policy in business development such as the availability of facilities and mentoring will support the growth of SMEs' engagement in e-business (Hadi Putra and Santoso, 2020). Business subsidy for diversifying sales channels is also needed by SMEs (Melnyk and Blyznyukov, 2021). Further, the industry affects the adoption of ebusiness among SMEs, such as industry association (Lawson et al., 2001), pressures from customers (Nugroho et al., 2017), and pressures from competitors (Ausat and Peirisal, 2021).

Conclusion

This literature study finds that SMEs all around the world face similar challenges in adopting e-business. However, they are different in the stage of adoption. In Europe, SMEs are quite advanced in terms of engagement with e-business and their competitiveness. The quantity of SMEs that engage with e-business is far above other continents. Furthermore, they have already adopted e-business far years ago. It is said that European SMEs and their ecosystem can be a role model for SMEs on other continents.

There are similarities of issues in adopting e-business. Based on TOE, most issues are found in organization, especially in terms of human resource capacity. SMEs are struggling in adopting e-business due to the limitation of capable human resources in their firms. Since e-business connects to a higher level of technology, the firms need to have a higher level of education and knowledge of their employees to be able to adopt e-business smoothly in their firms. However, what matters is not only about the adoption but the willingness to adopt ebusiness. The willingness to adopt ebusiness depends on the top management and owners' insights that relate to the competitiveness of their firms. By being competitive, SMEs will always want to increase their market shares and tend to sell their products borderless. To do that, SMEs need to adopt e-business.

The second issue found in the environment is IT infrastructure. SMEs in all continents face a challenge in IT infrastructure. The challenges include the availability of affordable connection internet and bandwidth. The infrastructure itself has a close relationship with the government's role. For countries with high support from government in terms of the the infrastructure, their SMEs engage more intensely in e-business.

The third biggest issue is in technology, namely business communication. There are levels of e-business adoption, starting from the simplest to the most complicated ones. Before firms adopt e-business, they usually adopt e-mail, websites, and e-commerce. It application is the of a business communication in firms. Most small firms adopt e-mail, websites, and e-commerce for their business before they adopt e-business. The bigger the firms are, the higher level of business communication they will adopt to make their business efficient.

Issues faced by SMEs in all continents tend to be similar when they want to adopt ebusiness. The findings help answer the question whether a general pattern or a model of e-business adoption that can fit all SMEs exists. These findings can be used as a practical guidance for any parties who may want to support the adoption of ebusiness for SMEs. The government as an important stakeholder for the SMEs may take some actions based on these findings so that the adoption of e-business for their SMEs can be accelerated and the domestic and borderless transaction such as export activities can be enhanced. Therefore, it can support the higher contribution of the country's GDP.

As a follow up of this study, further research on the sector or industry is necessary to investigate other specific issues regarding the adoption of e-business for SMEs. The findings might be different from one sector to another. Thus, it can provide a more comprehensive guidance for relevant parties including government who wants to take further action.

Notes On Contributor

Sinta Aryani is a lecturer and Assistant Professor at the School of Industrial Engineering, Telkom University. The area of interest is investment management, capital market, financial management, SMEs, and e-business.

References

- Abdullah, A., Murphy, L., & Thomas, B. (2015a). Measuring the E-Business activities of SMEs in Yemen. *ICSB World Conference Proceedings*, *October*, 1.
- Abdullah, A., Murphy, L., & Thomas, B. (2015b). Measuring the E-Business activities of SMEs in Yemen. International Conference on EBusiness, ECommerce, EManagement, ELearning and EGovernance, October, 122–127.
- Abdullah, A., Thomas, B., Murphy, L., & Plant, E. (2018). An investigation of the benefits and barriers of e-business adoption activities in Yemeni SMEs. *Strategic Change*, 27(3), 195–208. https://doi.org/10.1002/jsc.2195
- Abu Abid, A., & Rahim, M. M. (2012). Ebusiness Adoption Process by SMEs

in Saudi Arabia. 4th Global Conference on SME, Entrepreneurship & Service Innovation (GCSMES), September.

- AlBar, A. M., & Hoque, M. R. (2019). Factors affecting the adoption of information and communication technology in small and medium enterprises: a perspective from rural Saudi Arabia. *Information Technology for Development*, 25(4), 715–738. https://doi.org/10.1080/02681102.201 7.1390437
- Alderete, M. V. (2019). Electronic commerce contribution to the SME performance in manufacturing firms: A structural equation model. *Contaduria y Administracion*, 64(4), 1–24.

https://doi.org/10.22201/FCA.244884 10E.2019.1922

- Almunawar, M. N., Auzzali, A., Oseli, N. H., & Ariff, W. Z. A. M. Z. (2022). E-Commerce Adoption Among Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises in Brunei Darussalam. *International Journal of E-Business Research*, *18*(1), 1–18. https://doi.org/10.4018/ijebr.293297
- Ang, S. K., & Husain, W. (2012). A Study on Implication of Adopting E-Business Technology by SMEs. *Security, January*, 366–369.
- Ashurst, C., Cragg, P., & Herring, P. (2012). The role of IT competences in gaining value from e-business: An SME case study. *International Small Business Journal*, *30*(6), 640–658. https://doi.org/10.1177/02662426103 75703
- Ausat, A. M. A., & Peirisal, T. (2021). Determinants of E-commerce Adoption on Business Performance: A Study of MSMEs in Malang City, Indonesia. *Jurnal Optimasi Sistem Industri*, 20(2), 104–114. https://doi.org/10.25077/josi.v20.n2.p 104-114.2021
- Bi, R., Davison, R. M., & Smyrnios, K. X. (2017). E-business and fast growth

SMEs. Small Business Economics, 48(3), 559–576. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11187-016-9788-8

- Bordonaba-Juste, V., Lucia-Palacios, L., & Polo-Redondo, Y. (2012). The influence of organizational factors on e-business use: Analysis of firm size. *Marketing Intelligence and Planning*, *30*(2), 212–229. https://doi.org/10.1108/02634501211 211984
- Cataldo, A., & McQueen, R. (2014). Strategic driver or unimportant commodity? *Industrial Engineer*, 46(2), 36–41.
- Delawari, A. F. (2019). Online-business in Afghanistan, current trend and challenges ahead: A conceptual study. *Journal of Emerging Economies and Islamic Research*, 7(2), 44. https://doi.org/10.24191/jeeir.v7i2.87 64
- Demiroglu, N. (2021). E-commerce as a tool for the development of small business. *SHS Web of Conferences*, *106*, 01022. https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/20211 0601022
- Drew, S. (2003). Strategic uses of ecommerce by SMEs in the east of England. *European Management Journal*, 21(1), 79–88. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0263-2373(02)00148-2
- Erumi-Esin, R., & Heeks, R. (2015). E-Business Adoption and Use among African Women-Owned SMEs: An Analytical Study in Nigeria. ACM International Conference Proceeding Series, 15. https://doi.org/10.1145/2737856.2738 015
- Eurostat. (2022). Eurostat regional yearbook — 2022 edition. https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/pro ducts-flagship-publications/-/ks-ha-22-001
- Fillis, I., Johannson, U., & Wagner, B. (2004). Factors impacting on e-

business adoption and development in the smaller firm. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour & Research*, *10*(3), 178–191. https://doi.org/10.1108/13552550410 536762

- Gide, E., & Sandu, R. (2015). A Study to Explore the Key Factors Impacting on Cloud Based Service Adoption in Indian SMEs. *Proceedings - 12th IEEE International Conference on E-Business Engineering, ICEBE 2015, 1*, 387–392. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICEBE.2015. 72
- Grandon, E. E., & Pearson, J. M. (2004). Electronic commerce adoption: An empirical study of small and medium US businesses. *Information and Management*, 42(1), 197–216. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.im.2003.12.0 10
- Hadi Putra, P. O., & Santoso, H. B. (2020).
 Contextual factors and performance impact of e-business use in Indonesian small and medium enterprises (SMEs). *Heliyon*, 6(3), e03568. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2020.e03568
- Hossain, B. B., Hyun-woo, K., & Ho-kyun, S. (2019). Factors Affecting e-Commerce Adoption by Small and Medium Enterprises in Bangladesh.
- Hossain, M. R., Rehman, S. U., Elrehail, H., HARAZNEH, I., Alshawawreh, A. R., & Adaileh, M. J. (2021). Factors Influencing E-Business Adoption by Jordanian SMEs. *International Journal of Business Information Systems*, 1(1), 1. https://doi.org/10.1504/ijbis.2021.100 46676
- Hussein, W. N., Sulaiman, R., & Hamzah,
 A. K. (2013). E-business and cloud computing awareness for Malaysian SMEs: A recommendation from academic and industry perspectives. *International Conference on Research and Innovation in Information Systems, ICRIIS, December 2016*,

180-185.

https://doi.org/10.1109/ICRIIS.2013. 6716705

- Ifinedo, P. (2011). Internet/e-business technologies acceptance in Canada's SMEs: An exploratory investigation. *Internet Research*, 21(3), 255–281. https://doi.org/10.1108/10662241111 139309
- Kementerian Informasi dan Kominikasi (Kominfo). (2022). Mendigitalkan Indonesia. In *Laporan Tahunan 2021*. www.kominfo.go.id
- Kissiwaa, L., Xungang, Z., Ansah, S., & Ankrah, E. (2021). *E-Commerce Adoption among Small and Medium Enterprises in Ghana.* 4531, 182–205.
- Lawson, R., Alcock, C., & Cooper, J. (2001). *e-Business Adoption by Manufacturing SMEs in Regional Australia.* 658–676.
- Lee, S. (2021). E-commerce Adoption and Effects on South Korean SMEs During the Covid-19 Pandemic. International Journal of Applied Sociology, 11(1), 11–20. https://doi.org/10.5923/j.ijas.2021110 1.02
- Leogrande, A. (2022). *Digital Intensity in Europe.* https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.66675 56
- Levenburg, N., Magal, S., & Kosalge, P. (2006). An Exploratory Investigation of Organizational Factors and e-Business Motivations Among SMFOEs in the US. *Electronic Markets*, 16(1), 70–84. https://doi.org/10.1080/10196780500 491402
- Li, Y., Benson, K., & Faff, R. (2016). Political constraints and trading strategy in times of market stress: Evidence from the chinese national social security fund. *Finance Research Letters*, *19*, 217–221. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.frl.2016.08.0 02
- Mazzarol, T. (2015). SMEs engagement with e-commerce, e-business and e-

marketing. *Small Enterprise Research*, 22(1), 79–90. https://doi.org/10.1080/13215906.201 5.1018400

- Melnyk, M. V., & Blyznyukov, A. O. (2021). Electronic Business of Japan with U.S. Comparison the in Mechanism of**Economic** an 2021(2), 16-22. Regulation, https://doi.org/10.21272/mer.2021.92. 02
- Middleton, C., & Middleton, C. (2016). Understanding the costs and benefits associated with advanced e-business solutions in Canadian small and medium-sized enterprises. Report for Industry Canada Electronic Commerce Br ... Understanding the costs and benefits associated with advanced e- - - . July.
- Ming, Z. (2016). E-business Adoption among SMEs in China : A Study of the Perceptions of SMEs in Hunan Province. March, 1–182.
- Mpofu, K. C., Milne, D., & Watkins-Mathys, L. (2009). ICT Adoption and Development of E-business among SMEs in South Africa. *Proceedings of the ISBE 2009 Conference*, 1–20. www.isbe.org.uk/content/assets/BP09 -KnowledgeMpofu.pdf
- Mthembu, P. S., Kunene, L. N., & Mbhele, T. P. (2018). Barriers to E-commerce adoption in African countries. A qualitative insight from Company Z. *Journal of Contemporary Management*, 15(1815–7440), 265– 304.
- Mwila, M., & Ngoyi, L. (2019). The use of ict by sme's in Zambia to access business information services and investments: barriers and drivers. *Journal of Global Entrepreneurship Research*, 9(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40497-019-0145-7
- Nugroho, M. A., Susilo, A. Z., Fajar, M. A., & Rahmawati, D. (2017). Exploratory Study of SMEs Technology Adoption Readiness Factors. *Procedia*

Computer Science, *124*, 329–336. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2017.1 2.162

- Oliveira, T., & Martins, M. F. (2010). Understanding e-business adoption across industries in European countries. *Industrial Management and Data Systems*, *110*(9), 1337–1354. https://doi.org/10.1108/02635571011 087428
- Parida, V., Westerberg, M., & Ylinenpaa, H. (2009). How do small firms use ICT for business purposes? A study of Swedish technology-based firms. *International Journal of Electronic Business*, 7(5), 536. https://doi.org/10.1504/ijeb.2009.032 039
- Piscitello, L., & Sgobbi, F. (2004). Globalisation, E-Business and SMEs: Evidence from the Italian District of Prato*. *Small Business Economics*, 333–347.
- Prananto, A., Mckay, J., & Marshall, P. (2004). Lessons learned from analysing e-business progression using a stage model in Australian Small Medium Enterprises (SMEs). ACIS 2004 Proceedings, December, 75.
- Prananto, A., McKay, J., & Marshall, P. (2003). The spectrum of e-business maturity in Australian SMEs: A multiple case study approach to the applicability of the stages of growth for e-business model. *11th European Conference on Information Systems* (*ECIS*), 16–21.
- Rahayu, R., & Day, J. (2017). E-commerce adoption by SMEs in developing countries: evidence from Indonesia. *Eurasian Business Review*, 7(1), 25– 41. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40821-016-0044-6
- Ramsey, E., & McCole, P. (2005). Ebusiness in professional SMEs: The case of New Zealand. Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development, 12(4), 528–544. https://doi.org/10.1108/14626000510

628207

- Raviro, G., Samuel, M., Tinashe, Z. G., George, R., & Tinomuda, M. (2014). an Investigation of the Availability of E-Business Tools and Use in Smes in Gweru Zimbabwe. 2(3), 381–385.
- Sánchez-Torres, J. A., Berrío, S. P. R., & Rendón, P. A. O. (2021). The adoption of E-commerce in SMEs: The colombian case. Journal of Telecommunications and the Digital Economy, 9(3), 110–135. https://doi.org/10.18080/jtde.v9n3.40 3
- Siddoo, V., Sawattawee, J., Janchai, W., & Thinnukool, O. (2019). An exploratory study of digital workforce competency in Thailand. *Heliyon*, 5(5), e01723. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2019 .e01723
- Sukumar, A., Edgar, D., & Grant, K. (2011). An investigation of e-business risks in UK SMEs. World Review of Entrepreneurship, Management and Sustainable Development, 7(4), 380– 401.

https://doi.org/10.1504/WREMSD.20 11.042892

- Taylor, M., & Murphy, A. (2004). SMEs and e-business. Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development, 11(3), 280–289. https://doi.org/10.1108/14626000410 551546
- Wachira, K. (2014). Adoption of E-Business by Small and Medium Enterprises in Kenya: Barriers and Facilitators. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and*

Social Sciences, 4(11). https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v4i11/1293

- Wagner, B. A., Fillis, I., & Johansson, U. (2003). E-business and e-supply strategy in small and medium sized businesses (SMEs). Supply Chain Management, 8(4), 343–354. https://doi.org/10.1108/13598540310 490107
- Wang, Y., & Shi, X. (2009). E-business assimilation in SMEs of China. International Journal of Electronic Business, 7(5), 512. https://doi.org/10.1504/ijeb.2009.028 154
- Wynn, M. G., Turner, P., & Lau, E. (2013).
 E-business and process change: Two case studies (towards an assessment framework). *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 20(4), 913–933.
 https://doi.org/10.1108/JSBED-03-2012-0044
- Zare, Z. (2015). The benefits of e-business adoption: An empirical study of Iranian SMEs. UCT Journal of Management and Accounting Studies, 1(3), 9–16. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11628-006-0010-y
- Zhu, K., Kraemer, K. L., & Xu, S. (2006). The process of innovation assimilation by firms in different countries: A technology diffusion perspective on ebusiness. *Management Science*, 52(10), 1557–1576. https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.1050.04 87